doispontos:
Revista dos Departamentos de Filosofia da Universidade Federal do Paraná e da Universidade Federal de São Carlos

The Dissemination of Christine de Pizan's Works from the Fifteenth to the Eighteenth Century

A disseminação das obras de Christine de Pizan do século XV ao século XVIII

Karen Green
University of Melbourne, Australia
karen.green@unimelb.edu.au

Abstract: An overview of the dissemination of Christine de Pizan's works in manuscript, in print, and in translation is presented, spanning the fifteenth century to the eighteenth century and including a discussion of 'derivatives'––works that reused substantial extracts from Christine's writings. The popularity of the *Epistre Othea* is emphasized, as is the fact that the *Chapelet des Vertus* is not a source for the *Epistre*, but a derivative of it. The ownership of these texts by politically active women, including Anne of France, Margaret Beauford, Catharine of Aragon, Isabelle of Portugal, and Margaret of York, is discussed as is their role in the dissemination and translation of works into English and Portuguese. It is argued that the arguments in favour of women's capacity to legitimately exercise political authority, widely disseminated in Christine's texts, should be seen as a form of early feminism.

Keywords: Christine de Pizan; *Epistre Othea*; *Cité des Dames*; female authority; prudence; queenship.

Resumo: É apresentada uma visão geral da disseminação, entre o século XV ao século XVIII, das obras de Christine de Pizan em forma de manuscrito, em edições impressas e em tradução, incluindo uma discussão sobre os "derivados" — ou seja, obras que reutilizaram trechos substanciais dos escritos de Christine. É destacada a popularidade da *Epistre Othea*, assim como o fato de que o *Chapelet des Vertus* não é uma fonte da *Epistre*, mas sim um derivado dela. Discute-se a posse desses textos por mulheres politicamente ativas, entre elas Anne da França, Margaret Beaufort, Catherina de Aragão, Isabella de Portugal e Margaret de York, bem como o papel dessas mulheres na disseminação e tradução dessas obras para o inglês e o português. Defende-se que os argumentos a favor da capacidade das mulheres de exercer legitimamente autoridade política, amplamente difundidos nos textos de Christine, devem ser compreendidos como uma forma de feminismo precoce.

Palavras-chave: Christine de Pizan; *Epistre Othea*; *Cidade das Damas*; autoridade feminina; prudência; realeza feminine.

Recebido em 07 de março de 2026. Aceito em 30 de maio de 2026.

doispontos**:**, Curitiba, São Carlos, vol. 23, n. 1, p. 116 -131, ago de 2026 / ISSN: 2179-7412
DOI: 10.5380/dp.v23i1.103756

The past fifty years have witnessed a stunning effort of retrieval and revival of Christine de Pizan's works. Most are now available in modern editions, while many have been translated into modern languages. This paper builds on the scholarship responsible for the wide contemporary dissemination of Christine's ideas, to present an overview of the impressive earlier dissemination of her works, during the first four-hundred years following their production (SOLENTE, 1933; BROWN, 1998).[1] Christine was herself partly responsible for this. Her atelier regularly produced three or more presentation copies of her major works and combined them into the luxury illuminated compilations that survived in royal and ducal libraries (OUY, RENO, and VILLELA-PETIT, 2012). These manuscripts were then copied, plagiarised, transformed, and in some cases ultimately printed. Copies found their way to England, Portugal, Belgium, Holland, Germany, Italy, and Spain, and this dissemination was often promoted or encouraged by royal women. Here I am particularly interested in exploring the transmission of her ideas in the early printed editions of her works and in what I call 'derivatives,' works that plagiarise, rework, or are clearly inspired by one or more of Christine's works. Only those works that were printed or translated before the end of the eighteenth century are discussed, so some important works, most notably her early poetry, her *Mutacion de Fortune* and *Livre de paix* are not discussed (DE PIZAN, 1886; 1959; 1958; 2008). Thus, what is offered is not a comprehensive account of the dissemination of the totality of her *oeuvre*, which is beyond the scope of a single article, but an overview of her most influential works that demonstrates her pan-European influence and appeal.

Much of Christine's *oeuvre* was not printed before the late nineteenth century. Each of the works that appeared in print before this, has a distinctive history and influence, but overall, the story is one of Christine's significant presence in the history of European ideas, in particular in the history of political thought and in the debate over the status of women, as can be seen from the table at the end, which provides an overview of the number of manuscripts and translations of each of the works discussed. From this table, it can be seen that many texts were reprinted or appeared in their first printed French edition in Louise de Keralio's 1787 *Collection des Meilleurs ouvrages François composés par des femmes, dédiée aux femmes françoises* (KERALIO-ROBERT, 1786–1789). By the late eighteenth century, knowledge of Christine's earlier influence had waned, but the ripples of the feminist ideas that she had helped to disseminate, four hundred years earlier, had continued to spread throughout Europe. The later beneficiary of this transmission, Louise de Keralio, rediscovered manuscripts of Christine's works in the *Bibliothèque Royale*, where her father was one of the keepers of manuscripts and was then inspired to include them in her monumental work celebrating the contribution that women had made to the development of French literature. She thus became an important link, connecting the earlier and later phases of Christine's influence, by disseminating knowledge of these largely forgotten manuscripts to a more contemporary audience.

Epistre au dieu d'amours

Christine's earliest works were poems, most of which did not appear in print until published by Keralio. An exception is the *Epistre au dieu d'amours* which was printed in 1529 and was also translated into English and subsequently printed (FENSTER and ERLER, 1990). Christine wrote this long poem at a time when she was engaged in a debate over the morality of the *Romance of the Rose*, which she condemned for its misogynist portrayal of women as fickle and faithless, its obscene language, and its implication that women desire rape (DE LORRIS and MEUN, 1994; BAIRD and KANE, 1978; HICKS, 1977). The French printed version calls it *Le contre roman de la Rose nommé le gratia dei,* showing that it was clearly recognised by readers as an anti-*Roman de la Rose* text ([DE PIZAN], 1529). An interesting tit-bit of

[1] In writing this paper I have also been indebted to ARLIMA.net.

history concerning this publication is that the copy of it in the *Bibliothèque Nationale de France* belonged to Fernand Colombus, son of Christ Colombus, and was purchased in Lyons in 1535.

This was the earliest of Christine's works to be translated into English, though the 1402, *The Letter of Cupid* by Hoccleve, is not a direct and faithful transmission of Christine's attitudes, and there is debate over the extent to which it remains, as Christine's poem is, a forceful defence of women (BORNSTEIN, 1981; FLEMING, 1971). This was itself a widely disseminated poem (WATSON, 2018, p. 28–9, 243–4). The original probably arrived in England as a result of Christine's friendship with John Montagu, who was in France in 1396, arranging the marriage of Charles VI's daughter, Isabelle, to Richard II, during a period of détente in the Hundred Years War (LAIDLAW, 1982). Montagu returned to France in 1398, which is when Christine is assumed to have met him. Christine's son then went to England, as a companion to Montagu's son, and Christine says that she had sent various poems and books to Montagu, who was killed in 1400 defending Richard II, when the latter was overthrown by Henry IV. The new king then acquired Christine's manuscripts and attempted to lure her to England. She sent him a copy of the *Epistre Othea* but, claiming that she could not travel without her son as escort, managed to get the boy sent back to France, and then declined the invitation from the king, whom she considered a usurper. So, very early on, Christine was known and her work had some influence in England. This was also the case for the *Epistre Othea*, her most widely disseminated work (MOMBELLO, 1967a; 1967b; DE PIZAN, 1999, p. 2017).

Another more distant derivative, worth mentioning, is Martin Le Franc's *Le Champion des dames* (LE FRANC, 1999). This is a long defence of women, against the slanders of men, which includes Christine herself among the notable women whose wisdom and eloquence disprove the claim that women are men's inferiors. The opening illumination of the most important manuscript of the poem, BnF fr. 12476 shows women defending a castle of love that is highly reminiscent of the turreted city into which Christine leads her noble ladies in illuminated manuscripts of her *Livre de la cité des dames.* Produced in Brussels it celebrates the role of Isabella of Portugal, duchess of Burgandy (1397–1471) in the negotiations that resulted in the Peace of Arras of 1435. These negotiations brought to an end the conflict between France and Burgundy, that had begun thirty years earlier. This poem celebrates the political interventions of one of the women who was also involved in the dissemination of Christine's works, as discussed below.[2]

Epistre Othea

This was Christine's original best seller with more than fifty surviving manuscripts, though it is not now the work that gets the most attention suggesting that late medieval readers made rather different uses of vernacular books to contemporary readers (MOMBELLO, 1967a). The work is a series of short poems, each developing a moral injunction, followed by a 'glosse', which often contains a short narrative (in about a third of cases derived from the history of Troy) and a quotation from the ancients, that illustrates and reinforces the moral. These are followed by a Christian allegory, a quotation from Scripture, and a passage from the ancients, all to the same purpose. In it, Christine shows an appreciation of the wisdom of the pagans, saying that although God had not yet allowed them to be illuminated by the true faith, there were many great philosophers of the ancient civilizations, whose works demonstrate moral truths on which Christian allegories can be built. In adopting this attitude, she was partly inspired by the *Ovide moralisé*, which was also a source of some of the stories, and her work shares structural features with the *Somme le roi*, a late thirteenth century work on the virtues and vice. It is a book that one can dip into for moral edification. It is not likely that it was read from beginning to end, for it does not involve a continuous narrative, rather, extracts were intended to be read, possibly at mealtimes or on other occasions (WATSON, 2018, p. 92). Such edifying literature was often read aloud in such circumstances, which Christine, in her

[2] For Isabella's life and influence see (SOMMÉ, 1998; WILLARD, 1967, 1996; BERNARD, 1991).

advice to princesses, recommends as a worthy practice. In her major manuscript collections, each of the 100 stories is illuminated, adding to its appeal as a manual of moral instruction.

Not only was the *Epistre Othea* printed at least four times in France during the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, it was also translated three times into English (DE PIZAN, 1999; 2020; 2022).[3] It was first translated around 1450, as the *Epistle of Othea*, by Stephen Scrope, ward of the warrior John Fastolf, from a copy made in England and commissioned by Fastolf, now Laud Misc. Ms. 570. Fastolf had been the duke of Bedford's *maitre d'hotel* in Paris, and had fought at Patay, just after the liberation of Orléans, when the French army, inspired by Joan of Arc, had routed the English (DE PISAN, 1904; BÜHLER, 1949). Next it was translated by an unknown author, probably from a common ancestor of BnF fr. NAF 100059, that is an example of an early version of the text (DE PIZAN, 2020; 2022; SCHIEBERLE, 2019). This translation survives in a copy made by Anthony Babbington. Thirdly it was translated and printed by Robert Wyer from one of the French printed editions called the *Cent Histoires de Troie* (DE PIZAN, 1536).

One luxury manuscript of the *Othea* was included in a collection, BL Royal MS 14.E.II, confected for Edward IV for the education of his sons (WATSON, 2018, p. 91–2). A manuscript of the English translation, probably that by Scrope, was owned my Margaret Beaufort (1441/3–1509) the mother of Henry VII, who had inherited it from her sister-in-law (WATSON, 2018, p. 100). She was just one of a number of women who owned texts by Christine and were politically active during the period of the Wars of the Roses (WATSON, 2018, p. 247). Among these, Jacquette of Luxembourg (c.1416–1472) the second wife of the duke of Bedford was particularly significant for the dissemination of Christine's works. She had received the sumptuous collection of Christine's works that had been made for Isabeau of Bavaria, now BL Harley MS 4431, from Bedford, and after his death married Richard Woodville becoming an important player in English politics. Her daughter, Elizabeth, became the wife of Edward IV, while her son, Anthony was responsible for translations of works by Christine.

As I have argued elsewhere, the *Epistre Othea* was also plagiarised (GREEN, 2021a). The late fifteenth-century *Chapelet des vertues*, which was previously thought to have been a source for the *Othea,* was actually partly derived from it (BÜHLER, 1947; ROUSE and ROUSE, 2008). Rather than it being a source for Christine, it is a cobbled together 'new' work, constructed by taking a selection of the 'chapters' of the French *Fleurs des vertues*, a translation of an Italian work, the *Fiori di virtuti,* and enhancing these chapters with material drawn from the *Othea.* The re-ordering of the chapters of the *Fleurs*, in the *Chapelet*, so that they follow the ordering of the *Othea*, is part of the support for this contention.

Further evidence of the direct and indirect influence of Christine's work can be seen in the English, *Assembly of Gods*, once attributed to Lydgate, which is also partly derived from the *Othea* (BÜHLER, 1967; CHANCE, 1999). It has been argued further that her influence can also be found in *The Floure and the Leafe* and *The Assembly of Ladies* (CHANCE, 1994). In this case, as with the *Champion des dames*, themes from Christine and the debate over the *Romance of the Rose* are reworked in ways that attests to her lasting influence.

Le Livre du chemin de longue estude

Although it was by no means as widely disseminated as the *Epistre Othea*, this is a work that more explicitly develops themes of concerning the virtues of knighthood and nature of good government that are implicit in the earlier work. It is interesting for the way in which Christine's recommendation of government by a wise philosopher king faintly echoes Plato's ideal form of government. It only survives

[3] For a detailed account of its reception in England in both the French original and in translation see (WATSON, 2018)

in one printed edition, a late prose translation from 1549 by a Jan Chaperon (DE PIZAN, 1549). Little is known concerning the circumstances of this translation, but its existence shows that Christine's political philosophy was still appreciated over one hundred years after she first penned it.

Livre des fais et bonnes meurs du sage roy Charles V

This is one of the most substantial of Christine's works. In it she represents Charles V as having been an example of a wise philosopher king, who understood how to defend his country from its enemies, the English, who he had defeated, thereby re-establishing (for a time) the peace and prosperity of France (DE PIZAN 1997b, 1936–1940). He reappears in her later works of advice to princes, written for the benefit of his grandson, as the paradigm example to be emulated, of a good prince (DE PIZAN 1998; 2008). It was not as widely disseminated as her other works, of the five manuscripts that still exist, four are copies confected in Christine's atelier. One of these, in the Vatican Library, BAV Reg.lat. 920 was acquired by Christina of Sweden, who also owned a manuscript, BAV Reg.lat. 1328, of Christine's even less widely disseminated *Descripcion et diffinicion de la prodhommie de l'homme selon le duc d'Orleans*. This is a discussion of the nature of prudence, which was rewritten with the title the *Livre de prudence* and is another of Christine's works that focuses on the virtues of a good prince. Christina of Sweden also owned a copy of the *Epistre Othea*, as part of a compilation that included poems by François Villon, Eustache Deschamps and Alain Chartier, now Stockholm, Kungliga Biblioteket Vu 22, and owned a copy of *Le livre de la cité des dames* in a compilation containing historical works and works by Alain Chartier and Laurent de Premierfait, BAV Reginensi Latini 918. So, in the mid-seventeenth century, Christine's works were not entirely forgotten and were of particular interest to a ruling queen. It was not until the eighteenth century, however, that the biography of Charles V began to be edited as a source text for those interested in the history of France (DE PIZAN, 1785). It provides, important evidence for the development of Christine's ideas concerning good government. In the last section she discusses prudence or wisdom as the essential characteristic of a good ruler and introduces the distinction between natural and acquired prudence. This distinction will reappear in *Le Livre de la cité des dames* where it is argued that women are as well endowed with natural prudence as are men.

Proverbes moraulx

It is worth briefly mentioning the *Proverbes moraulx*, translated and printed in England by Caxton in 1478 (DE PIZAN, 1478). The translation of Christine's *Proverbes Morales* was done by Anthony Woodville, Earl of Rivers, who, through his mother, Jacquette of Luxembourg, had inherited Harley 4431. It was then reprinted as part of a collection of poetical works by Chaucer which begins with his 'The Boke of Fame'. Christine's work is sandwiched between Chaucer's translation of Alain Chartier's, 'La belle dame sans merci' and 'The complaint of Mary Magdeleyne' in a way that suggests, wrongly, that Chaucer was the translator, or the author of the text (WATSON, 2018, p. 11). This demonstrates a continued interest in Christine's works in England, which is particularly evident in the transmission history of her most explicitly feminist text.[4]

[4] Arlima claims that there is also a French edition in *Les dictz moraulx des philosophes, translatez de latin en françoys par noble homme Messire Guillaume de Tignonville, chevalier conseiller et chambellan du roy…*, Paris, Pierre Vidone [Vidoue], 1512 … the BNF only seems to have a copy from 1531.

Le Livre de la cité des dames

We now come to the book that has become the most widely known of Christine's works (DE PIZAN, 1997a; 2023b). Although now the most famous of Christine's works, the *Livre de la cité des dames* was not as widely copied as the *Epistre Othea,* perhaps because its content was not so appealing to a broad audience. It was not edited in full until the twentieth century, when two editions were done almost simultaneously, one in the USA the other in Germany (CURNOW, 1975; LANGE, 1974). Nevertheless, twenty-eight surviving French manuscripts of the work have been identified, attesting to its considerable popularity (VALENTINI, 2019). Surprisingly, the *Cité des dames* was not printed in France before the partial edition in Keralio's collection, but it was translated into what is called either 'Middle Dutch' or 'Flemish' and later into English (DE PIZAN,1521; LIE, 2015). Only one copy of the Dutch translation survives, British Library, Add. MS 20697, dated 1475. It was commissioned by Jan III de Baenst, a nobleman associated with the Burgundian court and is called, 'Het Bouc de Stede der Vrauwen.' It is generously illuminated, forty-one images have been completed, while spaces for another ninety-two images have not been filled. Forty-six years later, an English translation was printed at an interesting juncture in English history. In 1521, Henry VIII's queen, Catharine of Aragon had only produced one surviving daughter. She believed that her daughter, Mary, could inherit the throne of England. Famously her husband, Henry VIII, was convinced that he needed a male heir. The *Cité des dames* is a defence of women, against male misogyny, and argues for women's capacity to rule. It was in the context of the debate over a princess's capacity to inherit the crown that the English translation, *The Boke of the Cyte of Ladyes* was published by Pepwell (DE PIZAN, 2014; CURNOW, 1976). Although it was not intended to support Elizabeth I, in effect she benefitted from it, for it argues for women's prudence and capacity to govern. A moral and political philosophy grounded in prudence, a descendent of Aristotle's *phronesis*, which is called by Christine, the mother and guide of all the virtues, runs through all Christine's works from *Epistre Othea* to the *Cité des dames* (GREEN, 2005). In the mirror for princesses that she wrote after completing the *Cité des dames*, her advice is represented as the teachings of prudence (WILLARD, 1981). The image of women in authority as paragons of prudent government is later promoted by their supporters on both sides of the channel, in particular in the famous sieve portrait of Elizabeth I (GREEN, 2007).

Le Livre des trois vertus

In this didactic work, reason, rectitude, and justice, who had earlier instructed Christine on women's virtue, capacity to exercise prudence, govern estates, and their achievements in many areas of excellence, reappear in order to compel her to teach women of all estates, and particularly princesses, how they should exercise worldly prudence, in order to serve God (DE PIZAN, 1989). In this it is rather modern, since it represents the princess's path to salvation as equally achievable through active participation in the government of her estates, as through withdrawal into prayer and contemplation, the ideal proposed in most contemporary works of moral advice directed towards princesses during the medieval period.

This work was originally written for Marguerite of Burgundy, a daughter of John the Fearless, who was betrothed to Louis of Guyenne, the dauphin at that time. Interestingly, no manuscripts have been associated with her. After the death of Louis of Guyenne in 1415, she married, in 1423, Arthur Richmond, who had been her first husband's friend. She had many sisters and quite a few of the copies that have survived are associated with them and the Burgundian court. For instance, one sister Anne was the first wife of the duke of Bedford, regent for Henry VI in France. A copy in the Bodleian Fr. Ms. 5 (1440) may be associated with her or with Jacquette of Luxembourg. Another of Marguerite's sisters, Marie, was married to the duke of Cleves, Hague, Ms. 131 C26 is associated with her. This work also circulated among princesses and duchesses who were members of the French court. One copy, BNF fr. 452, was signed by Jeanne of France, Louis XI's disabled daughter, who was married to the duke of Bourbon. Her older sister, Anne

of France, was regent with her husband for her brother, Charles VIII during his minority. She educated a number of young princesses and duchesses at her court, including Marguerite of Austria, and Louise of Savoy, and she wrote a manual of advice for her own daughter, modelled on *Le livre des trois vertues* (WILLARD, 1991). In it she advised her daughter to read edifying works such as the *Somme le roi* and *Horologe de Sapience*, as well as the saint's lives and sayings of the philosophers.

The influence of this work continued into the next generation, with the advent of printing. Verard's edition, which survives in Vienna's Österreichische National Bibliothek, Ink.3.D.19 was dedicated to Anne of Brittany in 1497, when she became Charles VIII's wife and Queen of France. This presentation volume was printed on vellum and has an introductory miniature. Two or three further editions of the work appeared in France, in 1503 and 1536.

The geographical dissemination of this text was rather different to that of the *Cité des dames* (WILLARD, 1966). It was not translated into English but was translated into Portuguese (WILLARD, 1963; DE PIZAN, 2002). According to the introduction to the manuscript in the National Library of Madrid, MS.11515, the Portuguese translation was undertaken for Queen Isabel, wife of King Alfonso V of Portugal. This must have been before 1455, date of her death. The printed edition of 1518 was done at the command of Queen Leonor, widow of Dom João II (1481–95) and sister of the reigning Dom Manuel I. The original source of the French manuscript, from which the Portuguese translation was made was, according to Willard, Isabella duchess of Burgundy (WILLARD, 1963). She was the daughter of João I and his wife, Philippa of Lancaster, herself a daughter of John of Gaunt and niece of Henry IV of England. Isabella married Philip the Good, duke of Burgundy in January 1430 and was the aunt of the Queen Isabel who commanded the Portuguese translation. Nothing proves this line of descent, except for the fact that the work was widely disseminated throughout areas influenced by Burgundy during the fifteenth century and that the content of the work no doubt appealed to Isabella of Burgundy, who, in her own life, acted a part very much in line with Christine's prescriptions. As mentioned, she was praised in Le Franc's *Le Champion des dames* for having put her relationship with the English monarchy to good use, by helping to negotiate the Peace of Arras, signed between Burgundy and Charles VII of France in 1435.

Le Livre du corps de policie

This was a companion text to the *Livre des trois vertus*, being dedicated to Louis of Guyenne and having a similar tri-partite structure, allowing Christine to offer advice on good government and self-government to all the secular ranks of society, the higher nobility, responsible for governing kingdoms, principalities, and duchies, lesser nobility and knights responsible for great estates as well as wealthy merchants, and the common artisans, shop keepers and agricultural labourers, who she calls the belly and feet of the body politic (DE PIZAN, 1998). Christine's political advice to men was not as widely disseminated as her book of political advice to women, no doubt because there were plenty of male authored competitors. Nevertheless, in 1521, when the *Boke of the Cyte of Ladyes* was printed, an English translation of the *Corps de policie* was also printed in London, as *The Boke of the Body of Polycye*, (DE PIZAN, 1521). This English translation has been attributed to Anthony Woodville, who was responsible for the translation of the *Proverbes moraux* (BORNSTEIN, 1977; WATSON, 2018, pp. 56–60).

Le Livre de fais d'armes et de chevalerie

It has been suggested that this work was commissioned by John the Fearless for Louis of Guyenne, during a period in which he was Louis's guardian and tutor (DE PIZAN, 2021). This hypothesis is borne out by there being only two manuscripts deriving from Christine's atelier, one being found in the royal collection of the Brussels library. The other was part of the duke of Berry's library. This was later one of

Christine's most influential works, though often reproduced without being acknowledged as by Christine. For instance, Verard, who had also minimized her role in his edition of the *Livre des trois vertus*, represents the work as that of Vegetius, an important source for Christine. Nine manuscripts name Christine as author but fifteen present it as written by a man.

This work arrived in England as part of a luxury volume, presented by John Talbot, on the occasion of the marriage of Marguerite of Anjou with Henry VI, in 1445, now BL Royal 15.E.VI. Like Fastolf, Talbot had been at Patay and had fought in Henry V's wars in France. This marriage was intended to seal the peace between England and France, following the peace of Arras, agreed to in 1435, between France and Burgundy. Ironically, it led to the Wars of the Roses. Margaret of Anjou (1430–1482) has come down to us in the guise of a wicked queen, represented in Shakespeare's *Henry VI*, as having 'a tiger's heart wrapped in a woman's hide.' But actually, as the granddaughter of Yolande of Aragon, who had played an important role defending her son-in-law's right to the crown of France, and as a niece of Marie of Anjou, married to Charles VII of France, she no doubt thought it her role to defend her son's Lancastrian claim to the English throne, against the machinations of his great-uncle, Richard of York. She was ultimately defeated at the battle of Tewskbury (1471), where her son was killed, resulting in the succession of Edward IV. She endowed Queen's College of St Margaret and St Bernard at Cambridge, in 1448. The college was refounded by Elizabeth Woodville, wife of Edward IV and daughter of Jacquette of Luxembourg who had been close to Margaret.

William Caxton translated and printed the English translation of the *Fais d'armes*. His origins as a printer and translator are connected to the patronage and influence of another royal princess with connections to Burgundy and England. This was Margaret of York, (1446–1503) the sister of Edward IV, who, in 1468, was married to Charles the Bold, duke of Burgundy, the son of Isabella of Portugal and Philip the Good. This was not a fruitful marriage. Margaret was close to her sister-in-law Elizabeth Woodville, while in England, and shared religious and cultural interests with her mother-in-law, Isabella of Portugal. She was a model, educated princess though she did not produce any children. She was close to Charles' daughter by his first marriage, Mary of Burgundy. Mary's daughter, in turn, was to become Marguerite of Austria and would inherit many works by Christine. Margaret of York also wrote poetry and liked books, thirty of her manuscripts survive. Caxton, who was head of the English colony at Bruges welcomed her to Burgundy on her marriage and became part of her household. He showed her his attempt to translate a French history of Troy, which she corrected and told him to complete. This, *The Recuyell of the Histories of Troy* ultimately became the first book printed in England. Under the patronage of Edward IV, his sister Margaret, and their in-laws, the Woodvilles, Caxton returned to England in 1476, participating in the book trade and printing, among other works, Anthony Woodville's translation of Christine's *Moral Proverbes.* With the succession of Henry VII, Caxton's situation might have been expected to have deteriorated, but Henry was interested in representing himself as a wise and legitimate monarch. In 1486, he had married Elizabeth York, the daughter of Edward IV, and around 1489 he commissioned Caxton to translate and print Christine's *Fais d'armes*.

William Worcester, John Fastolf's secretary, had incorporated sections of the work into his, *Boke of Noblesse*, using Christine's use of the French translation of Vegetius in such a way as to imply that he had himself translated Vegetius' Latin (NALL, WAKELIN, and GAUTIER, 2015, pp. 86–7). He also mistakenly attributed to her the authorship of Honoré Bouvet's *L'arbre des batailles*, that she had extensively used. The *Fais d'armes* was also translated into German. This translation is now available in a modern edition, that points to the importance of the work as a practical and sober account of the conduct of war, the just reasons for going to war, the importance of paying soldiers fairly, and of avoiding pillage and the destruction of the life and property of non-combatants, as well as the duty to refrain from the use of inhumane methods of war, such as Greek fire, the ancestor of Napalm (DE PIZAN, 2023a).

In France, in Burgundy, in Portugal, and in England, Christine's works were known and promoted by powerful queens and duchesses. They were reprinted up to the middle of the sixteenth century. After this, fashions began to change, and Marguerite of Navarre took up the baton of literary patroness and author, echoing in her *Heptameron* themes from the debate on the *Romance of the Rose* and the virtues and vices of men in relation to women (BROAD and GREEN, 2009). One hundred years later, Margaret Cavendish almost certainly knew the Queen's manuscript, which was signed by her stepson (MALCOLMSON, 2002). While, as we have seen, Queen Christina of Sweden collected manuscripts of works by Christine. Although her works were only known to a select group of scholars and bibliophiles during the seventeenth and early eighteenth century, Christine was not entirely forgotten. Jeff Richards identified more than fifty references to her between 1545 and 1795 and did not notice two others, discussed by Solente (RICHARDS, 1991; SOLENTE, 1933).[5] Christine's works were then more comprehensively rediscovered, and extracts edited in the 1780's by Keralio-Robert who, looking back on the stream of women's literary works that had begun with her, sought, as Christine had done, to demonstrate the intelligence and capacity of women. For Keralio-Robert, Christine was as much an early contributor to the history of women as a contributor to French literature.

Until recently the political significance of historical women's writing has been largely dismissed. In the middle of the twentieth century, Simone de Beauvoir claimed that women had no history of their own, mentioning Christine de Pizan as merely one among a number of women, who had lamented the harshness of their fate, but had not created values or disputed men's empire (DE BEAUVOIR, 1949, vol. 1, p. 222). Christine's political works were only then beginning to be edited by scholars such as Suzanne Solente and Charity Canon Willard, and it would be another twenty-five years before editions of *Le livre de la cité des dames* appeared. The women who undertook the demanding and meticulous work of providing these editions were beneficiaries of a long history of demands by women to be recognised by men as their moral and intellectual equals and to be afforded an education that would enable them to develop their talents. But they did not theorise the historical origins of their new opportunities. Yet, had they done so, they would have recognised that it was due to earlier women's demands that, by the 1970s, women's entry into the universities was substantially secured, resulting in an explosion of feminist action and theory, that came to be called 'second wave feminism.' The first wave was initially identified with the nineteenth-century women's suffrage movement, that was assumed to have its roots in seventeenth-century liberal critiques of monarchism.

Early scholars working on Christine therefore tended to claim that it was anachronistic to call her a feminist (KING, 1991, p. 237; GOTTLIEB, 1985). Beatrice Gottlieb allowed that she, Marguerite of Navarre, and the men who praised women during the *querelle des femmes* thought that women deserved better in the world, but like King she argued that genuine feminism was an offshoot of later movements that demanded the equal rights of men. Yet this does not do justice to the fact that Christine clearly opposes masculinism, the view that men legitimately rule women but that it is a perversion of nature when women rule men. Once one defines feminism as anti-masculinism, and becomes aware both of the uptake of her work by women in positions of political power and authority during subsequent centuries, along with the repetition of many of her arguments during the later growth of opposition to patriarchal marriage, she emerges as an unparalleled contributor to the development of European political thought, and an important source for the emergence of feminism as a political doctrine within Europe, as has been argued elsewhere (FRASER, 1999; GREEN 2021b; 2024).

[5] Two works that mention Christine are discussed by Suzanne Solente are, *Les enseignements que une dame laisse à ses deulx filz*, BnF fr. 19919 (after 1476) and Pierre de Lesnauderie, *La louenge de Mariage et recueil des hytoires des bonnes, vertueuse et illustre femmes.* Paris: François Regnault, 1523 and 1525 reprinted by Jehan Saint-Denis, Alain Lotrian et Denis Janot, and by Pierre Sergent.

Bibliography

BAIRD, J. L., and J. R. KANE. 1978. *La Querelle de la Rose. Letters and Documents*. Chapel Hill: North Carolina Studies in Romance Languages and Literatures.

BERNARD, R. B. 1991. The Intellectual Circle of Isabel of Portugal, Duchess of Burgundy, and the Portuguese translation of *Le Livre des Trois Vertus* (*O Liuro dos Tres Vertudes*). In MCLEOD, G.K. *The Reception of Christine de Pizan from the Fifteenth through the Nineteenth Cenrturies: Visitors to the City*, 43–58. Lewiston, NY: The Edwin Mellen Press.

BORNSTEIN, D. ed. 1977. *The Middle English Translation of Christine de Pizan's Livre du corps de policie, Middle English Texts*. Heidelberg: Carl Winter.

_____.1981. Anti-feminism in Thomas Hoccleve's translation of Christine de Pizan's *Epistre au dieu d'amours*. *English Language Notes* 19: 7–14.

BROAD, J. and K. GREEN. 2009. *A History of Women's Political Thought in Europe, 1400-1700*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

BOWN, C. 1998. The Reconstruction of an Author in Print. In DESMOND, M. *Christine de Pizan and the Categories of Difference*, 215–35. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

BÜHLER, C. F. 1947. The *Fleurs de Toutes Vertus* and Christine de Pizan's *L'Epître d'Othéa*. *PMLA* 62: 32–44.

_____. 1949. Sir John Fastolf's Manuscript of the *Epître d'Othéa* and Stephen Scrope's Translation of this Text. *Scriptorium* 3: 123–8.

_____.1967. The *Assembly of Gods* and Christine de Pizan. *English Language Notes* 4: 251-4.

CHANCE, J. 1994. Christine de Pizan as Literary Mother. Women's Authority and Subjectivity in "The Floure and the Leafe" and "The Assembly of Ladies". In ZIMMERMAN, M and D. DE RENTIIS, *The city of scholars: new approaches to Christine de Pizan*, 245–59. Berlin: W. de Gruyter.

_____. ed. 1999. *The Assembly of Gods*. Kalamazoo, Mich.:: Medieval Institute Publications.

CURNOW, M. C. 1975. *The Livre de la Cité des Dames of Christine de Pisan: A Critical Edition*. Nashville, Tennassee. viii+1245 p. PhD, French. Vanderbilt University.

_____. 1976. *The Boke of the Cyte of Ladyes,* an English translation of Christine de Pisan's *Le livre de la cité des dames*. *Les Bonnes Feuilles* 3.

DE LORRIS, G. and J. DE MEUN. 1994. *The Romance of the Rose*. Translated by F. HORGAN. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

DE PISAN, C. 1904. *The Epistle of Othea to Hector or the Boke of Knyghthode*. Translated by S. SCROPE. London: J. B. Nichols and Sons.

DE PIZAN, C. 1478. *The Morale Prouerbes of Cristyne*. [London]: Enprinted by Caxton.

_____.1521. *The boke of the body of Polycye*. London: John Skot.

_____.1529. *Le contre roman de la Rose nommé le gratia dei* [Paris]: [Julien Hubert].

_____.1536. *The C. Hystoryes of Troy*. n.p.: Robert Wyer.

_____.1549. *Le Chemin de long estude de dame Christine de Pise. Ou est descrit le debat esmue au parlement de Raison, pour l'election du Prince digne de gouverner le monde. Traduit de langue romanne en prose françoyse, par Jan Chaperon, dit lassé de Repos. Tout par soulas*. Paris: De l'imprimerie d'Estienne Groulleau, demourant en la Rue Neuve de Nostre Dame à l'enseigne Sainct Jan Baptiste.

_____.1785. Memoires ou Livre des faits et bonnes meours du sage roi Charles V. Fait et compilé par Christine de Pisan, Damoiselle accompli. In ROUCHER, J. A. *Collection universelle des mémoires particuliers relatifs à l'histoire de France*, 85–279. London: np.

_____.1886. *Oeuvres Poétiques de Christine de Pisan*. Ed., M. ROY. 3 vols. Paris: Librarie de Firmin Didot et Cie. Reprint, Johnson Reprints,1965.

_____.1936–1940. *Le Livre des fais et bonnes meurs du sage roy Charles V*. 2 vols., Ed., S. SOLENTE. Paris: Champion. Reprint, Geneva, Slatkine, 1975.

_____.1958. *The "Livre de la Paix" of Christine de Pisan*. Ed., C. C. WILLARD. 'S-Gravenhage: Mouton & Co.

_____. 1959. *Le Livre de la mutacion de fortune*. Ed. S. Solente. 4 vols. Paris: Éditions A & J Picard.

_____.1989. *Le Livre des trois vertus*. Ed., C. C. WILLARD and E. HICKS. Paris: Champion.

_____.1997a. *La Città delle dame*. Trans. P. CARAFFI. Ed., E. J. RICHARDS. Milano & Trento: Luni Editrice.

_____. 1997b. *Le Livre des faits et bonnes moeurs du roi Charles V le Sage*. Trans. E. HICKS and T. MOREAU. Paris: Stock.

_____. 1998. *Le Livre du corps de policie*. Ed. A. J. KENNEDY. Paris: Honoré Champion.

_____.1999. *Epistre Othea*. Ed. G. PARUSSA. Geneva: Librarie Droz.

_____. 2002. *O livro das tres vertudes a insinança das damas*. Ed., M. DE LOURDES CRISPIM. Lisboa: Editorial Caminho, S.A.

_____.2008. *The Book of Peace*. Ed. and Trans. K. GREEN, C. J. MEWS and J. PINDER. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press.

_____.2014. *The Boke of the Cyte of Ladyes*. Tran. B. ANSLEY. Ed., H. JOHNSON. Tempe, Arizona: ACMRS.

_____. 2017. *Othea's Letter to Hector*. Trans. R. BLUMENFELD-KOSINSKI and E. J. RICHARDS. Toronto, Ontario: Iter Press.

_____. 2020. *Christine de Pizan's Advice for Princes in Middle English Translation: Stephen Scrope's The Epistle of Othea and the Anonymous Lytle Bibell of Knighthod*. Ed., M. SCHIEBERLE. Kalamazoo: Medieval Institute Publications.

_____.2021. *Le Livre des fais d'armes et de chevalerie*. Ed., L. DUGAZ. Paris: Garnier.

_____.2022. *An Epistle of Noble Poetrye: A Middle English Translation of Christine de Pizan's L'Epistre d'Othéa. Edited from London, British Library, MS Harley 838*. Ed., R. J. MOLL, A. SCHUURMAN, and E. PEZ. Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter.

_____. 2023a. *Le livre de faiz d'armes et de chevalerie/ Buoch von dem vechten und von de ritterschaft*. Ed., E. J. RICHARDS and D. BUSCHINGER. Berlin: De Gruyter.

_____.2023b. *Le livre de la Cité des dames*. Ed., and Trans., A. PAUPERT and C. LE NINAN. Paris: Champion.

FENSTER, T. and M. C. ERLER, eds. 1990. *Poems of Cupid, God of Love*. Leiden: Brill.

FLEMING, J. V. 1971. Hoccleve's "Letter of Cupid" and the "quarrel" over the "Roman de la Rose". *Medium Ævum* 40 (1): 21–40.

FRASER, A. S. 1999. The Origins and Development of Women's Human Rights. *Human Rights Quarterly* 21 (4): 853–906.

GOTTLIEB, B. 1985. The Problem of Feminism in the Fifteenth Century. In KIRSHNER, J. and S. F. WEMPLE, *Women of the Medieval World: Essays in Honour of John H. Mundy*, 337-64. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

GREEN, K. 2005. On Translating Christine de Pizan as a philosopher. In GREEN, K. and C. J. MEWS, *Healing the Body Politic: the political thought of Christine de Pizan*, 117–137. Turnhout: Brepols.

_____.2007. *Phronesis* feminized, prudence from Christine de Pizan to Elizabeth I. In BROAD, J. and K. GREEN, *Virtue, Liberty and Toleration: Political Ideas of European Women 1400-1800*, 23–38. Amsterdam: Springer.

_____. 2021a. The *Miroir des Dames*, the *Chapelet des vertus*, and Christine de Pizan's sources. In MONAGLE, C. *Intellectual Dynamism in the High Middle Ages*, 279–96. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

_____. 2021b. The Rights of Woman and the Equal Rights of Men. *Political Theory* 49 (3): 403–30.

_____. 2024. Feminism. In NEDERMAN, C. J. and G. BOGIARIS, *Research Handbook on the History of Political Thought*, 53–61. Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar.

HICKS, E., ed. 1977. *Le Débat sur le Roman de la Rose*. Paris: Honoré Champion.

KERALIO-ROBERT, L-F., ed. 1786–1789. *Collection des Meilleurs ouvrages François composés par des femmes, dédiée aux femmes françoises*. 14 vols. Paris: Lagrange.

KING, M. 1991. *Women of the Renaissance*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

LAIDLAW, J. 1982. Christine de Pisan, the Earl of Salisbury, and Henry IV. *French Studies* 36 (2): 129–43.

LANGE, M. 1974. *Christine de Pisan: Livre de la Cité des dames. Kritische Textedition auf Grund der sieben überlieferten "manuscrits originaux" des Textes*. Hamburg. Dissertation. University of Hamburg.

LE FRANC, M. 1999. *Le Champion des Dames*. Robert Deschaux ed. Paris: Honoré Champion.

LIE, O. S. H., M. MEUWESE, M. AUSSEMS, and H. JOLDERSMA, eds. 2015. *Christine de Pizan in Bruges, Le livre de la Cité des Dames as Het Bouc van de Stede de Vrauwen (London, British Library, Add. 20698)*. Hilversum: Verloren.

MALCOLMSON, C. 2002. Christine de Pizan's *City of Ladies* in early Modern England. In MALCOLMSON, C. and M. SUZUKI, *Debating Gender in Early Modern England 1500-1700*, 15–35. New York: Palgrave.

MCLEOD, G. K. 1991. *The Reception of Christine de Pizan from the Fifteenth through the Nineteenth Centuries: Visitors to the City*, Lewiston, N.Y.: Mellen.

MOMBELLO, G. 1967a. *La tradizione manoscritta dell'"Epistre Othéa" di Christine de Pizan*. Torino: Accademia delle Scienze.

_____.1967b. Notizia su due manoscritti contenenti l' "Epstre Othea" de Christine de Pizan ed altre opere non identificare [Paris, B.N., ms Nlles Acq. Fr. 6458 -Oxford Bodlian Library, ms. Laud. misc. 570]. *Studi Francesi* 31: 1-6.

NALL, C., D. WAKLIN and A. GAUTIER. 2015. Le déclin du multilinguisme dans "The Boke of Nobless" et con Codicille de William Worcester. *Médiévales* 68: 73–91.

OUY, G., C. RENO, and I. VILLELA-PETIT. 2012. *Album Christine de Pizan*. Turnhout: Brepols.

RICHARDS, E. J. 1991. The Medieval femme auteur as a provocation to literary history: eighteenth-century readers of Christine de Pizan. In MCLEOD, G. K., *The Reception of Christine de Pizan from the Fifteenth through the Nineteenth Centuries: Visitors to the City*. Lewiston: Mellon.

ROUSE, M. A. and R. H. Rouse. 2008. Prudence, Mother of the Virtues: the *Chapelet des Vertus* and Christine de Pizan. *Viator* 39: 185-228.

SCHIEBERLE, M. 2019. The Lytle Bibell of Knyghthod, Christine de Pizan's Epistre Othea, and the Problem with Authorial Manuscripts. *The Journal of English and Germanic Philology* 118 (1): 100–128.

SOLENTE, S. 1933. L'Influence littéraire de Christine de Pisan. *Bibliothèque de l'École des chartes* 94: 27–45.

SOMMÉ, M. 1998. *Isabelle de Portugal, duchesse de Bourgogne*. Lille: Presses Universitaires du Septentrion.

VALENTINI, A. 2019. La Tradition manuscrite du "Livre de la cité des dames" de Christine de Pizan: sur la genèse et l'évolution d'un texte majeure du XVe siècle. *Romania* 137 (3/4): 394–445.

WATSON, S. W. 2018. *Women, Reading, and Literary Culture: The Reception of Christine de Pizan in fifteenth-century England*. University Park. viii+304. PhD, English. University of Pennsylvania.

WILLARD, C. C. 1963. A Portuguese translation of Christine de Pizan's *Livre de Trois Vertus*. *PMLA* 78: 459-64.

_____. 1966. The Manuscript Tradition of the *Livre des Trois Vertus* and Christine de Pisan's Audience. *Journal of the History of Ideas* 27: 433–44.

_____.1967. Isabel of Portugal, Patroness of Humanism. In *Miscellanea di studi et richerche sul quattrocentro francese a cura di Franco Simone*. Turin: Giappichelli.

_____.1981. Christine de Pizan's *Livre des trois vertues*: Feminine Ideal or Practical Advice? In BORNSTEIN, D., *Ideals for Women in the Works of Christine de Pizan*, 91-116. Detroit: Michigan Consortium for Medieval and Early Modern Studies.

_____.1991. Anne de France, Reader of Christine de Pizan. In MCLEOD, G. K., *The Reception of Christine de Pisan from the Fifteenth through the Nineteenth Centuries: Visitors to the City*, 59–70. Lewiston, N.Y.: Mellen.

_____.1996. The Patronage of Isabel of Portugal. In MCCASH, J. H., *The Cultural Patronage of Medieval Women*, 306-20. Athens, Georgia: University of Georgia Press.

	L'Epistre du dieu d'amours	*L'Epistre Othea*	*Le Livre du chemin de longue estude*	*Le Livre des fais et bonnes meurs du sage roi Charles V*	*Proverbes Moraulx*	*Le Livre de la cité des dames*	*Le Livre des trois vertus*	*Le Livre du corps de policie*	*Le Livre de fais d'armes et de chevalerie*
	1399	1399	1403	1404–5	1405	1405	1406	1406–7	1410
Atelier	**Chantilly**, BdCh, 492, 67c–73d. **BnF,** fr. 12997, 65c–71d. **BnF**, fr. 835, 45a–50a. **BL, Harley** MS 4431, 51b–56c.	**Chantilly**, BdCh, 492,	**Brussels**, KBR, 10983. **Chantilly**, BdCh, 493,	**BnF**, fr. 10153, **Modène**, BE, α.N.8.7, **BnF**, fr. 5025, **Vatican**, BAV, reg. lat. 920.	**BnF**, fr. 24864, 176r–178v. **BnF** fr. 605, 3d–5d. **BL, Harley** Ms 4431, 259c–261c.	**BnF**, fr. 24293, **Paris, Arsenal**, 2686, **BnF**, fr. 1179. **Brussels**, KBR, 9393, **BnF**, fr. 607, **Leyde**, UB, Ltk. 1819 (fragment), **BL, Harley** MS 4431,	**Boston**, Pl, fr. Med.101, **BnF**, fr. nafr, 25636.	**Chantilly**, BdCh, 294, **BnF**, fr. 1197, **Paris, Arsenal**, 2681, **Besançon**, 423.	**Brussels**, KBR, 10476. **BnF** fr. 603
Manuscripts French	6 (one in England Westminster Abbey MS 21)	50+	9	5	8	28	23	9	22

Early printed editions, French	*Le contre roman de la Rose nommé le gratia dei* Julien Hubert, ca 1529 In *Collection des meilleurs ouvrages François composes par des femmes*, III.69–77, Keralio--Robert, Legrange, (1787)	Philippe Pigouchet,	*Le Chemin de longue étude,* traduit en prose par Jan Chaperon, Estienne Groulleau (1549) Parts in, *Collection des meilleurs ouvrages François composes par des femmes*, II. 297–415 Keralio--Robert, Legrange, (1787)	*Memoires ou Livre des faits et bonnes mœurs du sage roi Charles V*, in *Collection universelle des mémoires particuliers relatifs à l'histoire de France,* (1785)		Partial edition in *Collection des meilleurs ouvrages François composes par des femmes*, III.22–50, Keralio-Robert, Legrange, (1787)	*Le Trésor de la Cité des Dames, selon Christine*, Verard, 1497 *Le Trésor de la Cité des Dames de degré en degré et de tous estatz, selon Dame Christine* Michel Lenoir, (1503) *Le Trésor de la Cité des Dames, selon Dame Christine de la Cité de Pise*, Jehan André et Denis Janot, (1536)		*L'art de chevalerie selon Végèce,* Verard (1488)
Translations	English	English	French prose		English	English Flemish	Portuguese	English	English German
Manuscript translations	*Letter of Cupid*, Hoccleve, (1402) 10ms		*Epistle of Othea/The Boke of Knytghthode,* Scrope, 1440 *The Lytle Bibell of Knyghthod*, or *An Episte of Noble Poetry,* 1450			*Het Bouc van de Stede de Vrauwen,* Middle Dutch/ Flemish British Library Add. 20698, 1475	*Livro das tres vertudes,* National Library of Madrid	*The Body of Polycye,* Cambridge University Library, MS Kk.1.5, 1–79v.	*Das büch von dem vechten und von der ritterschaft*, Bern, 1473

Early printed translations		*The C. Hystoryes of Troy*, Robert Wyer (1536–45)			*The Moral Proverbes of Cristyne*, Caxton, (1478) *"Morall Proverbes of Christyne"* in *Here begynneth the boke of Fame by Geffray Chaucer* Richard Pynson (1526)	*The Boke of the Cyte of Ladyes*, Henry Pepwell (1521)	*Espelho de Cristina*, Hernao de Campos (1518)	*The Boke of the Body of Polycye*, John Skot, (1521)	*The Fayttes of Armes and of Chyvalry*, Caxton, (1489)
Derivatives		*Chapelet des vertus*, 13ms, printed, Michel Lenoir, (1500) *Assembly of Gods*							*Boke of Noblesse*, William Worcester, BL MS Royal 18 B XXII